2018 EVALUATION REPORT ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF VPA-FLEGT ANNEX VII IN CAMEROON
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of figures</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of tables</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Acronyms and Abbreviations</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>I. INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Verification of website accessibility</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The comparison of the organization of the information list from Annex VII with the organization as it appears on the «VPA-FLEGT Cameroon public information website».</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The number of categories and subcategories with at least one information, to determine how far information are published in each category and subcategory.</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The classification by year, and counting to identify, in each information subcategory, the years for which at least one information is available.</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Comparing the results of the 2018 and 2015 evaluations carried out by Forêts et Développement Rural (FODER):</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Analysis of issues surrounding the publication of information and the formulation of recommendations.</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>II. EVALUATION METHOD AND ANALYSIS FRAMEWORK</strong></td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The consistency of the categories of the website with those of Annex VII</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The level of publication in the categories and subcategories</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Evolution of information published by category between 2015 and 8 June 2018</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>III. RESULTS OF THE STUDY</strong></td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Difficulty in assessing the completeness and usefulness of the published information</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Difficulty in coordinating information collection</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Difficult match between published information and stakeholder needs</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>IV. CHALLENGES ON THE PUBLICATION OF INFORMATION OF ANNEX VII</strong></td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The need for a summary of information by categories and not just published documents</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The need for a list of information to be made public by sub-categories</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The need to strengthen the right to accessing forest information to increase the usefulness of information made public</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>V. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS</strong></td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The need for principles, criteria and indicators of transparency in forest management in Cameroon</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>VI. BIBLIOGRAPHY :</strong></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANNEX: Nominal list of documents and information made public on the VPA website on 08 June 2018.</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Level of publication of information by category ...................................................... 11
Figure 2: Comparison of publications by category between 2015 and 2018 ................... 15

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Consistency of categories used on the VPA website with those in the Agreement. ................................................................. 9
Table 2: Coverage rate of information to be made public from 2010 to 8 June 2018 11

LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

AFR  Annual Forest Royalty
BNC  Brigade nationale des operations de contrôle forestier et de lute anti-braconnage (National Forestry and Anti-poaching Control Operations Brigade)
CCS  Comité conjoint de suivi de la mise en œuvre de l’APV-FLEGT (Joint Monitoring Committee for the Implementation of VPA - FLEGT)
CNS  Comité national de suivi de la mise en œuvre de l’APV-FLEGT (National Monitoring Committee of the implementation of VPA-FLEGT)
CVEPB  Certificat de vente aux enchères publiques de bois (Public Timber Auction Agreement)
FMU  Forest Management Unit
FODER  Forêts et développement rural
IAS  Independent Audit of System
LAS  Legality Assurance system
MINFOF  Ministry of Forestry and wildlife
NTM  National timber market
SIGIF  Système informatique de gestion des informations forestières (Computerized Forest Information Management System)
VC  Vente de coupe (Sale of standing volume)
VPA-FLEGT  Voluntary Partnership Agreement on forest law enforcement, governance and trade
WPU  Wood Processing Unit
The publication of information from the Annex VII of the Voluntary Partnership Agreement on Forest Law Enforcement, Governance and Trade (VPA-FLEGT) signed between Cameroon and the Union European (EU) is one of the conditions to access information and therefore ensure transparency in the forest sector. A website dedicated to this annex has been created. This platform, if stable, is a permanent set up for the evaluation of the compliance of the Cameroonian party to publish information.

Civil society organizations have regularly assessed compliance with this commitment. The latest evaluation was carried out by the organization Forêts et développement rural (FODER) in 2015. The 2018 evaluation shed light on changes in information sharing between 2015 and 8 June 2018, date on which data collection on the VPA-FLEGT website ended for this second evaluation.

As of June 8, 2018, all the categories of information were published at least once. There is progress in the publication of information from 33.90% in 2015 to 73.09% on 8 June 2018, if information subcategories are considered. However, the coverage remains low with 16.18% of years covered by published information.

The reality of implementing the commitment to make the information in Annex VII public clearly shows that there are still number of challenges. There are three in particular. The first is the difficulty in assessing the completeness and usefulness of the published information. The second is the difficulty for the Cameroonian party to coordinate the collection of information. The third is the mismatch between the information made public and the needs of stakeholders.

The results and challenges in the implementation of VPA-FLEGT Annex VII in Cameroon reveal a number of needs. The first is to systematically summarise information by category beyond the documents that are published which contain a host of other information. The second is the need to specify the lists of documents to be made public within certain subcategories of information. The third is to strengthen access to forest information, as the publication of information falls more in line but with a communication strategy. The fourth and final is the need for criteria, and indicators of transparency in forest management in Cameroon.
Cameroon freely engaged in the VPA-FLEGT with the European Union. Under this agreement, the country commits to apply its forest regulations, to improve its governance so as to improve trade in timber and derived products towards European Union.

As part of this Agreement, Cameroon commit (see Article 21 of the Agreement) to publish information in such a way as to ensure transparency, and consequently to ensure good governance of its forest management. A list of information to be made public has been agreed between both parties to the VPA-FLEGT. The Agreement clearly states that “in order to achieve the objective to ensure transparency of the functioning of the FLEGT licensing scheme ... the parties agree to use the most appropriate communication mechanisms” to make this information public, the details of which are given in Annex VII. The latter also specifies that several channels can be used, including official reports, websites, multi-stakeholder platforms, public meetings, press conferences, films, radio and television stations.

Measures have been taken as part of the implementation of this commitment by the Cameroonian party. On the contrary to other channels that do not always guarantee permanent information, it was decided that a website was the most permanent and lasting solution, and that only it allowed a real-time monitoring of the information on the implementation of this commitment. Thus, a website has been created under the link http://apvcameroun.cm/. This website clearly entitled “website for VPA-FLEGT Cameroon public information” is effective.

The VPA-FLEGT website has been regularly monitored by civil society organizations for the evaluation of the implementation of Annex VII. The 2018 evaluation conducted by FODER was intended to see the level of compliance with the commitment made by the Cameroonian party to make the list of information mentioned above publicly available. This paper reports on the assessment of the level of compliance with this commitment from an approach that is worth presenting.
The purpose of the evaluation was to determine the level of publication of the Annex VII information list compared to the situation of the study conducted by FODER in 2015. The data was collected between 8 May and 8 June 2018.

The collection process consisted in 6 steps:

1. Verification of website accessibility

At the time of the study, the “VPA-FLEGT Cameroon public information website” was accessible online. However, it particularly unstable and its accessibility is not always guaranteed, even with broadband internet connection. It has to be consulted several times to succeed to download certain files. At the end of the data collection period, during which the information collection team regularly tried to download the documents, there are two subcategories in which a total of 6 files could not be retrieved, though they were actually uploaded on the website.

2. The comparison of the organization of the information list from Annex VII with the organization as it appears on the «VPA-FLEGT Cameroon public information website».

The annex classifies the information into 10 categories within which there are 75 sub-categories. This was to ensure that this same configuration is reproduced on the website to ensure the representativeness of all information to be made public on the platform.

3. The number of categories and subcategories with at least one information, to determine how far information are published in each category and subcategory.

The task was to check the categories and subcategories in order to identify the subcategories that are not informed. It remains difficult to assess the completeness of the documents published at this level given the absence of an exhaustive and agreed list for some subcategories of information.

4. The classification by year, and counting to identify, in each information subcategory, the years for which at least one information is available.

The years covered by the information published under each category remain a fundamental criterion for assessing the level of completeness of the publication of information. These are not the years in which the information was published, but of those to which the subcategories of information concerned relate. Although information is published for a subcategory, this does not guarantee that this information is available for all years. The starting point is the year of signature of the Agreement. The objective at this level was to assess the years for which published information was missing.
5. Comparing the results of the 2018 and 2015 evaluations carried out by Forêts et Développement Rural (FODER).

The comparison was to assess progress in the publication of information within the 10 categories of Annex VII, including those on the National Timber Market.

6. Analysis of issues surrounding the publication of information and the formulation of recommendations

Based on the previous, we analysed the level of publication of information and formulate recommendation to improve the implementation of this commitment.

III RESULTS OF THE STUDY

1. The consistency of the categories of the website with those of Annex VII

The formulation and classification provided for in Annex VII are not those which have been systematically used on the website. There are some variations, which do not question the coherence of the idea of information made public.

Table 1: Consistency of the categories i the VPA website with those in the Agreement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories as in the VPA</th>
<th>Number of sub categories</th>
<th>In the “VPA website…”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Category</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal information</td>
<td>(10)</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on Production</td>
<td>(06)</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on Attribution</td>
<td>(11)</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information forest management plan</td>
<td>(10)</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on Processing</td>
<td>(06)</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on Export</td>
<td>(02)</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on the legality assurance and control system</td>
<td>(10)</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on Audit</td>
<td>(05)</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on financial transactions</td>
<td>(06)</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on institutional set-up</td>
<td>(09)</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The categories on the VPA website show that information listed are broadly consistent with those of the VPA-FLEGT Annex VII. However, an additional category has been added, namely the one relating to the National Timber Market (NTM), under which there are two subcategories of information: 1) organization and operation of the DTM, and 2) Moratorium on the exploitation of Bubinga and Wengue species.

With regard to information on Production, it can be noted that the list of information provided by VPA-FLEGT is not entirely available on the website. In fact, the following information is not provided on the VPA website and therefore remains unspecified:

- “Annual volumes processed by type of products, by species and by company”, “annual volumes of timber and derived products imported to Cameroon and per country”, and the “annual volumes of timber sold at public auction”.

With regard to information on Export, a subcategory is added to the 2 provided in Annex VII. It is the “COMCAM Reports” which present statistics of annual specifications of forest products at the Douala Sea port.

Finally, concerning information on financial transactions, there is a sub-category “financial transaction” whose tab is not active.

2. The level of publication in the categories and subcategories

All the 10 categories of Annex VII, including the additional one on the DTM, have been published at least once, taking to 100% the coverage rate of information categories in Annex VII, including that on legal information treated separately because of the imprecise wording of most subcategories. This total is broadly divided into subcategories as follows:

![Figure 1: Level of publication of information by category](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attributions</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Processing</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exportation</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development (10 subcategories)</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial Transactions (7 subcategories)</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutional set-up (9 subcategories)</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legality Assurance System (LAS) (10 subcategories)</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audits (5 subcategories)</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Timber Market (NTM)</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
However, when subcategories are considered, not all are accompanied by published documents. Therefore, within each category taken individually, there are discrepancies between publications rates of information in the subcategories associated as of 8 June 2018. These variations can be summarized in the following tables:

**Table 2: Coverage rate of information to be made public from 2010 to 8 June 2018**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category of information</th>
<th>Publication rate as of 8 June 2018</th>
<th>Coverage rate of information from 2010 to 8 June 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Legal information</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on Production</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information On Attribution</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on forest management plan</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on Processing</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on Export</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on the legality assurance system and control</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>07%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on Audit</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>09%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on financial transactions</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on institutional set-up</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on national Timber Market</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>GENERAL AVERAGE</strong></td>
<td><strong>73.09%</strong></td>
<td><strong>16.18%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The data collected shows that publication rate by category of information is above the average. However, once the periods covered by the published information are considered, the coverage rate remains very low and a wide range of documents still need to be published to improve this rate and to ensure better access to information. The information made public as provided in Annex VII by category remains difficult to assess in the years concerned. Indeed, much of the information to be made public accounts for the state of forest management plan at some point in the life of the State. It is therefore useful to ensure the level of publication of information at the level of years. The elements below are considered.

**a. On allocation:**

Documents relating to the attributions published on the VPA website consulted on 08/06/2018 are those of the sections below. The years concerned are summarized in the table below.
### Publications on attributions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of valid titles</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of annual operating permits/annual logging certificates issued</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location map of valid logging titles</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location map for areas available for logging</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Official areas of valid logging titles and allocation price (AFR)</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notices of various, Invitation to tender (Forest concession, sale of logs, timber recovery permits, timber permit, etc)</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on pre-emptive right</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results of interministerial title allocation committee</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of annual withdrawals of secure documents (workside books, DF10 and way bill)</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of approved forestry companies</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notification of start of activities for timber salvage licences</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### On processing:

Documents relating to processing published on the VPA website ([http://apvcameroun.cm/index.php/transformation#](http://apvcameroun.cm/index.php/transformation#)) consulted on 08/06/2018 are those of the sections below. The years concerned are summarized in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of approved processing companies</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
c. On production

Documents relating to production published on the VPA website ([http://apvcameroun.cm/index.php/transformation#](http://apvcameroun.cm/index.php/transformation#)) consulted on 08/06/2018 are those of the sections below. The years concerned are summarized in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total annual log production</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual volume of logs exported</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual volume of logs exported to the EU</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual authorized logging volume</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


d. On exports

Documents relating to exportation published on the VPA website ([http://apvcameroun.cm/index.php/transformation#](http://apvcameroun.cm/index.php/transformation#)) consulted on 08/06/2018 are those of the sections below. The years concerned are summarized in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Data on timber in transit</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data on export per species, country, and company</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMCAM Reports</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
e. On management

Documents relating to forest management plan published on the VPA website (http://apvcameroun.cm/index.php/transformation#) consulted on 08/06/2018 are those of the sections below. The years concerned are summarized in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mandate, role and responsibility of ministries in charge of management</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of concessions under management</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of communal forests and their surface areas</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surface areas of allocated forest concessions</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surface area of forest concessions under management (including annual operation plans and five year management plans)</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surface areas of forest concessions with approved management Plan</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surface areas of certificated forest concessions</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Documents for approved management plans</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terms and conditions</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental impact studies</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

f. On financial transactions

Documents relating to financial transactions published on the VPA website (http://apvcameroun.cm/index.php/transformation#) consulted on 08/06/2018 are those of the sections below. The years concerned are summarized in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Financial transactions</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of forest disputes (summary of offenses)</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
g. On institutional set up

Documents relating to institutional organisation published on the VPA website consulted on 08/06/2018 are those of the sections below. The years concerned are summarized in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Joint monitoring committee</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of the joint monitoring committee</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure and functioning of the joint monitoring committee</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure and functioning of the national monitoring committee</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports of the national monitoring committee</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of issuance authorities</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of competent authorities</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of competent authorities</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aides-memoires and declaration of the joint implementation Council</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

h. On legality assurance system (LAS)

Documents relating to legality assurance system (LAS) published on the VPA website consulted on 08/06/2018 are those of the sections below. The years concerned are summarized in the table below.
### On Audits

Documents relating to audits published on the VPA website consulted on 08/06/2018 are those of the sections below. The years concerned are summarized in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Audit terms of reference</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedures to recruit auditor</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audit results</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complaints against audits and their handling</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction of corrective measures</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### i. On Audits

Documents relating to audits published on the VPA website consulted on 08/06/2018 are those of the sections below. The years concerned are summarized in the table below.
j. On the national timber market (NTM)

Documents relating to internal timber market published on the VPA website consulted on 08/06/2018 are those of the sections below. The years concerned are summarized in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Organisation and functioning of ITM</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suspension of exploitation of Bibinga and Wengue</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. Evolution of information published by category between 2015 and 8 June 2018

A comparison of the publication of information between 2015 and 8 June 2018 reveals that there has been a significant increase in publications on the website dedicated to Annex VII of the VPA-FLEGT in Cameroon. It increased from 33.90% information published by category in 2015 to 72.18% on the 8 June 2018.

This progress is mainly seen in the following categories: production, export and institutional set-up information, where no information was published in the 2015 evaluation. However, there is a decrease in the number of information published under the financial transactions and audits categories, while the publication rate in the attribution category has remained constant.
IV  CHALLENGES ON THE PUBLICATION OF INFORMATION OF ANNEX VII

Three major stakes revolve around the evaluation of the publication of VPA-FLEGT Annex VII information.

1. Difficulty in assessing the completeness and usefulness of the published information

As it stands, it is difficult to assess the completeness of the information published in the different subcategories, given their usefulness to forest management stakeholders in Cameroon. Indeed, there is no consensus on the specific information that must be published within the different subcategories. Similarly, no format is agreed about the presentation of the said information. Therefore, it is difficult to assess the impact of the publication of information on the participation of different stakeholders, and the quality of the transparency of forest management processes.

2. Difficulty in coordinating information collection

The collection of information remains a real challenge because of the multiplicity of information and its authentication processes. Indeed, the quantity of potential information referred to by the different subcategories of Annex VII is very large and varied. Therefore, collecting them requires some organization, sensitization and coordination of all the stakeholders who generate the information at various levels. This does not seem to be working well yet despite the existence of a public information management procedures manual in the forest sector under VPA-FLEGT Annex VII, entering into force by MINFOF Decision No. 00017/MINFOF/SG/DF of 20 January 2016.

Similarly, the procedures associated with the publication of the information involve, inter alia, the authentication of the information to be published, and the decision on the information that should systematically be published within a specific category of information. In addition, certain information in Annex VII produced by other administrations is available on websites other than that of MINFOF without a reference or a link to the associated documents being indicated on the page dedicated to the VPA-FLEGT. The same applies to information in certain subcategories contained in documents under other categories.

3. Difficult match between published information and stakeholder needs

There are documents published on the VPA-FLEGT website which contain the information announced. However, the vast majority of these documents sometimes contain more than one piece of information, or information that must be extracted using specific keys. The information needs of forest management stakeholders are most often related to the processes in which they actually participate. Despite the importance of the publication of Annex VII information, the specificity of information needs in given forest management processes raises the question of the adequacy of published infor-
information with the needs of different categories of stakeholders like local communities and indigenous peoples. The latter have very limited access to new information and communication technologies.

How stakeholders relate to information is scantily discussed. It therefore appears that while published information is a significant step forward in the transparency process, building access to forest information as a right for stakeholders at all levels is a necessity. There is need to consider more deeply the issue of the usefulness of information for different categories of stakeholders, and their ability to have remedies, so as to ensure the effectiveness of transparency put forward by the process.

To round off, the framework for the implementation of VPA-FLEGT Annex VII, which is based on its communication plan, needs to be evaluated and updated to meet the needs and challenges that the day-to-day implementation of Annex VII reveals.

1. The need for a summary of information by categories and not just published documents

Stakeholders consulted during the various evaluations of the implementation of Annex VII question their relationship with published documents. Indeed, the documents are distinct from the specific information they contain. The documents are the sources of the information and not always the information by itself. A regularly updated summary of this information is therefore a necessity for vulnerable stakeholders, particularly in the context of specific forest processes in which they participate in this capacity. The information needs of the various stakeholders remain not well known and must be clearly identified.

2. The need for a list of information to be made public by sub-categories

The consensual nature of the process by which the categories and subcategories of information to be made public have been decided does not elude the difficulty of implementing this option. It can be noted that some subcategories actually refer to information while others refer to documents, or even a mixture of both. In the absence of a specific list of publicly available information for each information subcategory of Annex VII, it remains difficult to make a totally objective assessment. Indeed, within each of the subcategories, the actors can freely
claim various types of information, as far as those responsible for publication can freely refrain from publishing specific information without particular justification. It would therefore be useful to consider the consensual formulation of a minimum list of information and documents to be published within each information subcategory to be made public, as well as the modalities for updating.

3. The need to strengthen the right to accessing forest information to increase the usefulness of information made public

The publication of forest information under the above-mentioned conditions is set as a principle. However, accessing forest information as a right for forest stakeholders remains a challenge. Yet, it is important in a Cameroonian context marked by the absence of a clear framework for access to information and participation in forest management processes. More specifically, Cameroon has not ratified the 1998 Aarhus Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-Making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters. In such a context, the recognition of access to forest information as a right, especially for the most vulnerable, is a necessity, and debates on this issue should be made more firmly in all discussions on transparency and forest good governance in Cameroon.

4. The need for principles, criteria and indicators of transparency in forest management in Cameroon

Ultimately, monitoring transparency in the forest sector requires much more than just access to information. The tools for participatory evaluation will guarantee the quality and transparency of forest management processes. Although there are currently a variety of tools to assess forest governance, transparency-specific tools remain poorly visible within them. The need for instruments to monitor transparency in forest management processes is clearly justified and is necessary in a context strongly marked by the doubt that the absence of such a framework authorises from stakeholders of forest management processes.
VI BIBLIOGRAPHY:


ANNEXE : ANNEX: Nominal list of documents and information made public on the VPA website on 08 June 2018.

1. ALLOCATIONS

i. List of valid titles with names of the recently awarded companies

- List of valid titles for 4th quarter of 2017
- List of valid titles for 2nd quarter of 2017
- Exploitation titles granted to forest exploiters in March 2015
- Exploitation titles operational in March 2015
- Titles granted in July 2014
- Valid titles in July 2014
- Valid titles of community forests in July 2014

ii. List of annual operation permits/annual operation certificates issued

- Titles granted in March 2014
- Operational titles in March 2014
- Operational council forests in March 2014
- List of valid titles in March 2013
- FMU and SL situations as at 27 March 2013
- Operational community forests as at 27 March 2013

- Title-op-1-Quarter2
- Title-op-2-Quarter2
iii. Location Maps for Valid Operating Titles (Interactive Atlas)
   • No location map is published on the site.

iv. Location map of annual surface areas open to exploitation
   • No location map of annual areas published.

v. Official area of valid exploitation titles and attribution price (AFR)
   • No publication on the official areas of valid titles and attribution price under the tab. However, this information is published in the same files of the tab presented under 1.1.

vi. Invitation to tender (forest concession, sale of logs, authorization of timber recovery, timber permit, etc.)
   • AAO April 2012 and its corrigendum (for forest concessions)
   • AAO No. 0055 of 13 April 2017 on the attribution of 29 CV
   • AAO Attribution 39 CV 2016
   • PEBO November 2012
   • PEBO May 2012
   No information on ARB/AEB and Special products.

vii. Information on pre-emptive rights
   • Report of mission on pre-emptive rights 2013
   • Report of mission on pre-emptive rights 2012

viii. Results of interministerial commissions for attribution of titles.
   • FMU results 2012
   • SL results 2012
   • CV results 2013
   • Publication of AAO results for CV 2017
   • PEBO December 2012
   • PEBO October 2012
   No information on ARB/AEB and Special products.

ix. List of annual withdrawals of secured documents (Worksite book, DF10 and consignment note)
   No information published on annual withdrawals of secure documents

x. List of authorised companies in the profession
   • List of authorised companies in activity
   • List of authorised companies in the profession of exploiter
   • Companies authorised in activity in 2015
xi. The only file published under this title has no title and is not active and therefore, not downloadable at the time of the study.

- The only file published under this title has no title and is not active and therefore, not downloadable at the time of the study.

2. PROCESSING

i. List of authorised processing companies
- File_utb_georeferences
The two files below though attached were not accessible to date with a “404 Error” message.

- List of authorised processing companies
- Categorisation of processing units

ii. Location of processing units (physical addresses and/or geographical coordinates of processing units)

- Location of processing units (2014)

iii. Processing capacity per processing units (% of the capacity effectively used)

- Processing capacity per processing unit (2012)

iv. Volume which entered factory/company
- State_entry_factory_28_11_2017
- Volumes entered factory 2014

v. Volume that came out of factory/company
- Volumes that came out of factory 2014

vi. Stock at the end of the financial year
No file published on stocks at the end of the financial year

3. PRODUCTION

i. Annual total production of logs
- Annual production of logs 2014 and 2015
- List of CVEPB 2017

ii. Total annual volume of logs exported per specie
- Total annual volume of logs exported 2014
- Total annual volume of logs exported 2015

iii. Annual volume of logs exported per species to the EU
- Annual volume of logs exported to the EU 2014
- Annual volume of logs exported to the EU 2015

iv. Annual volumes authorized for logging
- Volumes authorised for logging 2013
- Volumes authorised for logging 2014
- Volumes authorised for logging 2015
4. EXPORTATION

i. Data on timber on transit
   • Data on timber on transit 2015

ii. Data on exports per specie, per country and per company
   • Data on exports per specie per country 2015

iii. COMCAM reports
   • COMCAM 2016
   • COMCAM 2015
   • COMCAM 2014
   • COMCAM 2013
   • COMCAM 2012
   • COMCAM 2011
   • COMCAM 2010
   • COMCAM 2009

5. MANAGEMENT

i. Mandate, role and responsibility of ministries in charge of forest management
   No information published

ii. List of concessions under management
   • List of concessions under management 2015

iii. List of Council forests and their surface areas
   • List of communal forests developed
   • Council forests November 2017
   • FC Abong-Mbang APU_CLA
   • FC_AKOM2_Efoulan_ACPSON
   • FC_AKOM2_Efoulan_ACTIA
   • FC_AKOM2_Efoulan_APU_CLA_2014
   • FC_AKOM2_Efoulan_DECLA_2010
   • FC_AKOM2_Efoulan_PA_2014
   • FC_AMBAM_APROPRIATE
   • FC_AMBAM_DECLA
   • FC_AMBAM_ANGOSSAS_APU_CLA_2009
   • FC_AMBAM_BATOURI_AMS_2003
   • FC_AMBAM_BENG_BIS_DECLA_2015
   • FC_BIPINDI_and_LOLODORF_APU_CLA

iv. Surface of forest concessions allocated
   • List and surface area of forest concessions attributed
   • Surface of forest concessions allocated 2015

v. Surface of forest concessions under management (including annual operation plans and five year management plans)
   No information published.

vi. Surfaces of forest concessions with approved management plan
   • List of forest concession surface area with approved management plan
vii. Surface areas of certified forest concessions
- List of surface areas of certified forest concessions
- Surface area of certified forest concessions up to 2015

viii. Documents of approved management plan
- FMU 11005 APROPA
- FMU 10060 APROPA
- FMU 10059 APROPA
- FMU 10045 APROPA
- FMU 09025 APROPA
- FMU 09004b APROPA
- FMU 09004a APROPA
- FMU 09003 APROPA
- FMU 09005a APROPA
- FMU 09005b APROPA
- FMU 00001 APROPA

ix. Terms of reference
- FMU 09003_CC (year illegible)
- FMU 09004a_CC (year illegible)
- FMU 09005a_CC (year illegible)
- FMU 090013_CC (year illegible)
- FMU 09022_CC
- FMU 10033_CC
- Terms of reference SFIL
- Terms of reference SFIL FMU
- Terms of reference 2006

x. Environmental impact studies
- FMU00001_EIE (no year on document)
- FMU00002_EIE (2006)
- FMU10062_EIE (2006)
- FMU10064_EIE_2005
- FMU11004_EIE_2008

6. FINANCIAL TRANSACTIONS

i. Financial transactions
File uploaded but impossible to download

ii. List of forest disputes (summary of offenses)
- Summary of offenses_09_2013

iii. Annual report on forest revenue
- Report of forest revenue 2
- Evolution of forest taxes from 2000-2014
- Forest revenue from BNC fines_2015
- Annual report on forest revenues

iv. Annual deposits of annual forest royalties (AFR) per title
- The file uploaded here is that of the evolution of forest taxes from 2000-2014 published under 6.3

v. List of payment of local and national taxes
No information published

vi. List of fines for offenses
- No information published

vii. List of offenses paid
- Follow-up of payment of fines 2015

7. INSTITUTIONAL SETUP
Documents relating to institutional setup actually published on the VPA website (http://apvcameroun.cm/index.php/transformation#) consulted on 08/06/2018 are those of the sections below. The years concerned are summarized in the table in the report.
i. Joint implementation committee
   • Rules of procedure of the joint implementation council
   • Final press release of VPA Council Meeting No. 6
   • Aide-memoire of the council meeting No. 4 of 17 December 2014
   • Aide-memoire of the council meeting No. 3 of July 2013
   • Aide-memoire of the council meeting No. 2 July 2012
   • Aide-memoire council No. 1 March 2012.

ii. Report of the joint monitoring committee
   • Aide-memoire 9th session joint monitoring committee (JMC)
   • Aide-memoire JMC No. 8 of 28.10.2015
   • Aide-memoire JMC No. 7 of 07.07.2015
   • Aide-memoire JMC No. 6 of 23.04.2014
   • Rules of procedure of the joint monitoring committee
   • Aide-memoire JMC No. 4
   • Aide-memoire JMC No. 3
   • Aide-memoire JMC No. 2
   • Aide-memoire JMC No. 1

iii. Structure and functioning of the joint monitoring committee
   • Rule of procedure JMC_Fr
   • Rule of procedure joint council_Fr

iv. Structure and functioning of the national committee
   • Order on functioning of VPA national committee.

v. Report of national monitoring committee
   • Functioning of NMC
   • Report of NMC N2 of 19.04.2013
   • Report of 2nd NMC session of 10.04.2013
   • Report of 7th NMC of 3 December 2015
   • Report of 6th NMC of 4.09.2015

vi. List of issuing authorities
   • No information published

vii. List of competent authorities
    List of FLEGT competent authorities

viii. Reports of competent authorities
    • Cameroon annual report 2015
    • 2014 annual report
    • 2013 joint report_VPA-FINAL
    • Annual report VPA 2012 signed

ix. Aide-memoire and declaration of council
    • Aide-memoire Council
    • Aide-memoire 7th Council
    • Aide-memoire of 7th Council of 15.12.2015
    • Aide-memoire of 6th Council of 10.10.2015
    • Aide-memoire of 5th Council of 20.06.2014
    • Aide-memoire of 7th Council of 17.12.2013
    • Final declaration of 8th Council
    • Final declaration of 7th Council of 15.12.2015
    • Final declaration of 6th joint Council of 10.08.2015
8. LEGALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM (LAS)

i. Evaluation criteria of LAS
   • Evaluation criteria of LAS

ii. Issuance procedure of the legality certificate and FLEGT authorisations
   • Information guide of operators of the forest sector to obtain a certificate of legality (File not accessible)
   • Criteria and modalities for issuance of legality certificates (File not accessible)
   • Issuance procedure of FLEGT authorisations (File not accessible)
   • Entry into force of SIGIF (File not accessible)

iii. National strategy and control modalities
   • National control strategy (year 2005)
   • Forest controller’s Guide (File not accessible)
   • Procedures manual of timber legality control (File not accessible)

iv. Reports of the Independent observer of titles allocation
   • No information published

v. Reports of the Independent observer of the forestry control
   • Independent observer report SGSOC Official
   • IO-FLEGT-AGRECO-CEW-067_prog_Est_Bumba-et-Ngoko_May-2013 Report

vi. Reports of control brigades
   • Situational analysis of missions 2014
   • Mission report in the Sanaga Maritime 2014
   • Mission report in the Lobo locality 2014
   • Mission report in the Lolodorf locality 2014
   • Situational analysis of missions 2013
   • Mission report in the Dibang locality 2013
   • Mission report in LembeYezoum 2013
   • Mission report for Nyong and Mfoumou and Dja and Lobo 2013
   • Mission report for So’o Lala 2013
   • Mission report for Belabo 2013
   • Mission report for Nyong and So’ 2013
   • Mission report for Eseka 2012
   • Mission report for Nlonako 2012
   • Mission report for SL 0903206

vii. List of legality certificates issued
   • Aucune information publiée

viii. List of FLEGT authorisations issued
   • No information published

ix. Rejected applications for certificates
9. AUDITS

i. Audit terms of reference
   • IAS survey of seized timber Annex 1. ToR seized timber and evaluation of small titles
   • IAS FLEGT Cam. Annex 3. ToR Seized Timber and Evaluation docs small titles.

ii. Auditor recruitment procedures
   • No information published

iii. Audit results
   • No information published

iv. Complaints on audits and their handling

10. NATIONAL TIMBER MARKET (NTM)

   • Organisation and functioning of NTM
   • Order on the organisation and functioning of NTM
   • Decision list of special products of particular interest to Cameroon
   • Decision on categorisation of processing units and determining the level of processing of timber products

   It can be noted that legal information has been replaced by those on the national Timber Market.

   i. Suspension of the exploitation of Bubinga and Wengue
   • Order on the suspension of the logging of Bubinga and Wengue in the national domain for conservation purposes.